

**West Virginia State University Board of Governors
Presidential Review Process Ad Hoc Committee
113 Ferrell Hall
April 23, 2014
4:00 p.m.
Agenda**

1. Call to Order and Roll Call—Committee Chair Paul Konstanty, presiding
2. Verification of Appropriate Notice of Public Meeting Action 2
3. Review and Approval of Agenda Action 1
4. Review and Approval of Minutes of Previous Meeting Action 3
5. Review and Possible Recommendation to the Full Board of BOG Policy #61 Action 5
6. Adjournment

West Virginia State University Board of Governors
Presidential Review Process Ad Hoc Committee

Date/Time: 4/23/2014 -- 4:00 PM

Location:

West Virginia State University, Ferrell Hall, Room 113, Institute, WV

Purpose: To conduct regular business of the Committee

Notes:

This is a compliant meeting.

Meeting was approved : 3/26/2014 2:59:39 PM

**West Virginia State University Board of Governors
Presidential Review Process Ad Hoc Committee
103 Ferrell Hall
Minutes
March 19, 2014**

1. **Call to Order and Roll Call**

Mr. Konstanty, Chair, called the meeting of the West Virginia State University Board of Governors Presidential Review Process Ad Hoc Committee to order at 4:00 p.m.

Present: Mrs. Jarvis, Mr. Lipscomb, Mr. Swingle, and Dr. Thralls. Other members of the Board and University staff were present.

2. **Verification of Appropriate Notice of Public Meeting**

Mr. Swingle made the motion to approve the meeting notice and it was seconded by Dr. Thralls. The motion passed.

3. **Review and Approval of Agenda**

Mr. Swingle made the motion to approve the agenda and it was seconded by Mrs. Jarvis. The motion passed.

Mr. Konstanty provided introductory remarks regarding the two-part Committee charge including the evaluation of the President, which has been completed, and the creation of a Board policy, which remains before the Committee.

4. **Overview of Exemplar Policy Development**

Mr. Konstanty provided an overview of several institutional Board policies regarding presidential evaluation. Mr. Swingle encouraged the Committee to keep the policy broad to allow for interpretation and flexibility moving forward. Dr. Thralls agreed with this approach and encouraged a full review of the current presidential contract and any mention of presidential employment in existing Board policies.

The Committee began discussion on several specific components of a contract such as awarding tenure and setting performance and institutional goals. Through Committee discussion, it was decided that the policy should not specifically address these items and it is more appropriate for those items to remain in the contract.

The Committee discussed the need for a two-part policy to address not only the evaluation of the President, but also the employment of the President. The Committee reached a consensus that the proposed policy should address both of these areas.

The Committee also discussed the need to have one process for the annual review and a separate process for the comprehensive review.

5. **Discussion of Institutional Exemplar Policies**

Mr. Konstanty advised that the Committee will need to develop a policy and recommend it to the full Board. Based on Committee discussion, Mr. Konstanty will take the lead on drafting the policy and the Committee will reconvene on April 23, 2014 at 4:00 p.m. to review it in advance of the May 1, 2014 Board of Governors meeting.

6. **Adjournment**

With there being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:55 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Ashley L. Schumaker
Chief of Staff and
Special Assistant to the President

WEST VIRGINIA STATE UNIVERSITY BOARD OF GOVERNORS

West Virginia State University

PROPOSED BOG Policy # 61

TITLE: Employment and Evaluation of the President

Section 1. General

- 1.1 Scope: This policy establishes guidelines, processes, and procedures related to the selection, appointment, responsibilities and evaluation of the President of the University.
- 1.2 Authority: West Virginia Code § 18B-1-6, § 18B-1B-6
- 1.3 Effective:
- 1.4 Adopted:

Section 2. Employment of the President

- 2.1 The President of West Virginia State University is appointed by and serves at the will and pleasure of the Board of Governors, pursuant to West Virginia Code § 18B-1B-6, and West Virginia State University Board of Governors Bylaws Article III (12).
- 2.2 The Board of Governors shall be empowered to take all reasonable and necessary steps to search for a President in times of vacancy, including but not limited to conducting a national search, employing a search committee comprised of interested person appointed by the Chairman of the Board of Governors, or retaining the services of a professional search agency or consultant(s). The Board may also retain the services of legal counsel to negotiate on behalf of the Board consistent with Bylaws Article III (17).
- 2.3 The Chairman of the Board of Governors, in consultation with the Executive Committee and the advice of the full Board of Governors, the search committee, search agency or consultant(s), shall draft a memorandum outlining the terms, conditions, responsibilities and duties of the prospective President in a form consistent with the form contract recommended by the Higher Education Policy Commission, which shall be presented to the full Board for approval by majority vote prior to presentation to the prospective President.
- 2.4 The Board shall be guided by analysis of peer and market data in offering the terms, conditions, responsibilities and duties of the prospective President, whether for initial appointment or successive appointment following the initial appointment. The Board may, in its discretion, offer to award a prospective President academic rank and tenure at the University following consultation with the Provost and appropriate College Dean and Department Chair. The Board shall have the authority and latitude necessary to make all reasonable, necessary and appropriate specific offers to the prospective President consistent with the training, education, experience and status of the prospective President.

- 2.5 Following approval, by majority vote of the full Board of the memorandum outlining the terms, conditions, responsibilities and duties of the prospective President as described above, the Chairman of the Board shall present a final written contract to the prospective President in the form prescribed by the Higher Education Policy Commission for execution; and thereafter, shall submit the same to the Higher Education Policy Commission and the Chancellor for approval.

Section 3. Duties and Responsibilities

- 3.1 The President is responsible to and shall report to the West Virginia State University Board of Governors. Consistent with the policies of the Board of Governors, the written contract executed with the President, and as approved by the Higher Education Policy Commission, the President is the Chief Executive Officer of the University and has general authority and the responsibility for the University as an institution. The President shall keep the Board fully apprised of matters affecting the University in a reasonable and timely manner.
- 3.2 The President is expected to exhibit such conduct, candor and collegiality expected of a University President and shall not withhold information vital to the success and perpetuation of the University from the Board of Governors.
- 3.3 The President shall possess and use leadership skills necessary to advance the mission of the University and to vigorously pursue any specific goals and objectives outlined in the written contract executed with the Board of Governors. The President is expected to have a keen understanding of the University's role in serving higher education in the surrounding community and to work with the Board of Governors and the Higher Education Policy Commission to develop initiatives to meet those needs. This expectation includes the ability to lead the University community, foster a culture of cooperation among faculty, staff, administrators and students in fulfilling the University's teaching, research and public service responsibilities.
- 3.4 The President, as the Chief Executive Officer of the University, shall consult with faculty, classified staff, administrators and students at reasonable and appropriate times, in furtherance of discharging the duties and responsibilities conferred upon the President by the Board of Governors. The use and employment of yearly summit meetings, town hall meetings, summary addresses, or other opportunities for meaningful feedback is strongly encouraged to provide for the exchange of information and ideas from those constituents to the President; and to ensure that the policies, procedures and actions of the Board of Governors are effectively communicated in a timely manner to those constituents. The President, from time to time, may be directed by the Board of Governors to make immediate communications with those constituents from the Board of Governors.
- 3.5 In addition to these general expectations, and those specifically enumerated within the President's written contract with the Board of Governors, the President shall also:

- 3.5.1 Implement the Mission Statement of the University as approved by the Board of Governors through effective leadership;
- 3.5.2 Provide effective leadership and support for the academic programs of the University that are consistent with the Mission of the University, the higher education needs of the surrounding community, while ensuring appropriate resources for attaining the highest standards of quality;
- 3.5.3 Foster a culture and support for student life that compliments the Mission of the University, the needs of a diverse campus population and which preserves the rich history of the University;
- 3.5.4 Hire, retain, train and develop a competent, cooperative and collegial administrative organization and staff to ensure the effective, efficient and professional management of University operations, or to discharge administrators or staff that fail or refuse to work toward those goals;
- 3.5.5 Maintain lawful, equitable and effective personnel programs, including the appointment of qualified persons to the faculty, adjunct faculty, staff and administration and to promote, retain or dismiss for cause for the same, with due regard to the best interests of the University and the State of West Virginia;
- 3.5.6 In conjunction with the Chief Financial Officer of the University and with guidance provided by the Finance Committee of the Board of Governors, propose recommended annual operating and capital budgets and other financial plans for the effective and efficient operation of the University in order to support the Mission of the University and the academic and athletic programs essential to the continued viability of the University. In discharging this obligation, the President should remain fully informed and be consistently mindful of the fluid funding allocated by the State of West Virginia to the University and shall have processes and procedures in place to react to budgetary events;
- 3.5.7 Effective collaboration with the Higher Education Policy Commission to communicate the University Mission and needs of higher education to the Governor, State Legislators, other State and Local Government Officials, Local Community Leaders and Stakeholders;
- 3.5.8 Maintain a proactive, effective and consistent presence at the State Capitol to impart the Mission of the University and to advocate for the assistance necessary from the State of West Virginia for the continued viability of the University;
- 3.5.9 Interact and maintain a positive profile with all appropriate external bodies to achieve the Mission of the University, consistent with Board of Governors polices, statutory and regulatory provisions and sound academic principals;
- 3.5.10 Undertake reasonable and appropriate assignments as requested by the Board of Governors and the Higher Education Policy Commission;

- 3.5.11 With respect to the expectations enunciated in section 3.5.4 and section 3.5.5 above, the President is vested with the final institutional-level authority and responsibility for every personnel action within the University, with the exception of any decisions relating to the President's own employment or compensation. The President shall appropriately consult with the campus community and legal counsel as necessary, but shall retain the ultimate authority for such decisions.
- 3.5.12 The President shall address any deficiencies or concerns arising out of any annual, tri-annual or comprehensive review of performance to the satisfaction of the Board of Governors in order to continue employment, including any request for improvement or action not otherwise specified in the written contract then existing.

Section 4. Evaluation of the President

- 4.1 The West Virginia State University Board of Governors, by appointment from the Chairman of the Board, established a Presidential Review Ad Hoc Committee for the purpose of evaluating the President of the University in year 2013 and to develop the evaluation procedure outlined in this Section, consistent with West Virginia Code § 18B-1B-6.
- 4.2 The Higher Education Policy Commission, consistent with West Virginia Code, requires the evaluation of University Presidents annually, tri-annually, or at the conclusion of a contract cycle. The Presidential Review Ad Hoc Committee has endeavored to present a routine and consistent mechanism for those periodic reviews. The Presidential Review Ad Hoc Committee shall become a standing Committee of the Board of Governors whose sole purpose is to ensure the President of the University is evaluated consistent with the following guidelines.
- 4.3 The West Virginia State University Board of Governors shall yearly form a "Presidential Review Committee," appoint a chairperson, and elect four (4) additional members to the Committee from the Board of Governors. The Board shall make such amendments to the Bylaws of the Board of Governors as necessary to effectuate this process.
- 4.4 The "Presidential Review Committee" shall discharge the following duties, whether annually, tri-annually, or at the conclusion of a contract cycle. To the extent that a comprehensive review is conducted as a result of a end of contract cycle review which would be followed by a tri-annual review, the Board may seek approval from the Higher Education Policy Commission to dispense with the comprehensive tri-annual review and to conduct the annual review following a comprehensive review as the former would be redundant and an unnecessary use of time and resources. Any time a comprehensive review is performed of the President and would be followed by a mandatory comprehensive review by reason or tri-annual review, or end of contract cycle, the Board may seek approval of the Higher Education Policy Commission to dispense with a successive comprehensive review as redundant and an unnecessary use of time and resources.

4.5 The Annual Review

- 4.5.1 The Higher Education Policy Commission, in conjunction with West Virginia Code, requires an annual review of the President of the University.
- 4.5.2 The West Virginia State University Board of Governors acknowledges the obligation and inherent need to annually review the President of the University irrespective of the contract term of the current President.
- 4.5.3 In view of the policy contained below related to the tri-annual comprehensive review and conclusion of contract cycle review, the annual review of the President shall be conducted in accordance with this section.
- 4.5.4 The Presidential Review Committee shall convene during August/September of each academic year to begin the process of evaluating the President. The chairperson of the Committee, as appointed by the Chairman of the Board, shall coordinate the annual review with the assistance of the Committee members.
- 4.5.5 The chairperson of the Presidential Review Committee, or the chairperson's designee, shall announce a thirty-day comment period to the campus and the community to solicit feedback regarding the President's performance. Such comments will be kept confidential and shared with the Presidential Review Committee, and subsequently the Board of Governors, in a summary format without individually identifying any person or name associated with the information.
- 4.5.6 Once the thirty-day comment period has concluded, the Board of Governors will meet in executive session to receive the summary report of the Chairman of the Presidential Review Committee. The full Board shall hold a discussion to determine if there were sufficient comments received during the thirty-day period. To the extent that it is determined that sufficient comments were received to have a representative sample, the full Board shall then hold a discussion in executive session regarding President's performance, specifically to address and comment upon the President's leadership, assess the quality of written information disseminated by the President's office, assess the accomplishments or lack of progress toward the University's Mission by the President during the review period, and note any concerns raised in comments received during the 30 day period. If it is determined that an insufficient number of comments were received during the thirty-day comment period, the Chairperson of the Presidential Review Committee, or a designee thereof, may request additional time to solicit further comment from any campus or community constituency that may be under-represented. Those comments shall be reported in the same manner as outlined herein, either at the next full Board meeting (in executive session) or at a specially called meeting. The Board shall then hold its discussion in executive session regarding the President's performance, specifically to address and comment upon the President's leadership, assess the quality of written information disseminated by the President's office, assess the accomplishments or lack of progress toward the University's Mission by the President during the review period, and note any

concerns expressed by any comments received during the thirty-day period or thereafter directly solicited by the Chairperson of the Presidential Review Committee.

- 4.5.7 A written summary report, based on the comment period, including any directly solicited comments by the Chairperson of the Presidential Review Committee, and the Board discussion held in executive session, shall be presented to the President and the Chairman of the Board and afford the President the opportunity to make any response, written or verbal, that the President deems appropriate.
 - 4.5.8 The Chairman of the Board shall orally summarize the written summary report to the full Board during executive session to preserve the confidentiality of the comments and information and in order to preserve the overall process as a personnel matter for the President.
 - 4.5.9 The Chairman of the Board shall entertain a motion from the Board, outside of executive session, to accept the written summary report from the Presidential Review Committee, to place it in the personnel file of the President, and to report to the Higher Education Policy Commission that the annual review of the President was conducted, the dates it was conducted, the types of personnel involved in the review, and whether the conclusion of the review was favorable or unfavorable. To the extent that the conclusion of the review was unfavorable, the Chairman of the Board, in conjunction with the President, shall agree upon such terms, actions or other procedures to address any deficiency or concerns identified; and those deficiencies or concerns shall be specifically addressed in the next annual, tri-annual, or end of contract cycle review.
 - 4.5.10 The annual review of the President shall be concluded sufficiently in advance of the last calendar year Board of Governors meeting such that the Board may receive the information prior to the end of the calendar year and make any appropriate recommendations or take any appropriate actions. It is presumed that the annual review shall be completed prior to the December Board of Governors meeting such that the Board may receive the information and act at the December meeting.
- 4.6 The Tri-Annual Comprehensive Review and End of Contract Cycle Review
- 4.6.1 The Presidential Review Committee shall have the authority to contract with an external consultant to conduct the tri-annual comprehensive review or end of contract cycle review. Whether conducted by the Presidential Review Committee or an external consultant, the comprehensive review required by West Virginia Code and the Higher Education Policy Commission at this interval shall be conducted as follows:
 - 4.6.2 The Presidential Review Committee shall convene during August/September of the applicable academic year to begin the process of conducting a comprehensive review evaluating the President. The chairperson of the Committee, as appointed by the Chairman of the Board, shall coordinate the comprehensive review with

the assistance of the Committee members; and the Committee may determine, by majority vote, that an external consultant is advisable. The Chairman shall approve the expense of retaining an external consultant.

- 4.6.3 The comprehensive review of the President shall consist of on-campus interviews of:
 - 4.6.3.a The President;
 - 4.6.3.b The President's Cabinet and all senior-level administrative support staff;
 - 4.6.3.c The Faculty Senate;
 - 4.6.3.d Additional faculty members in a caucus not to exceed 10 Faculty members not otherwise serving on the Faculty Senate;
 - 4.6.3.e At least 10 classified staff representatives;
 - 4.6.3.f At least 10 students;
 - 4.6.3.g The Director of Athletics;
 - 4.6.3.h At least two Athletic Coaches;
 - 4.6.3.i The Director of Physical Facilities;
 - 4.6.3.j The Chief of Campus Police; and
 - 4.6.3.k At least five local community leaders.
 - 4.6.3.l The entire Board of Governors (the faculty representative, the classified staff representative and the student representative may choose whether to be interviewed in the Board of Governors' caucus, or their individual caucuses, but not both).
- 4.6.4 The on-campus interviews shall be led by the chairperson of the Presidential Review Committee, or an external consultant. The interviews shall be private within each specific caucus and the information obtained in the interviews shall remain confidential in order to foster an atmosphere of open and frank communication. Each specific caucus shall be asked specifically to address and comment upon the duties and responsibilities enumerated herein at sections 3.5.1 through 3.5.12, in addition to any benchmarks or goals established in the President's written contract. The President's written contract shall be made available to any external consultant retained for the purpose of conducting the comprehensive evaluation.
- 4.6.5 Following the on-campus interviews, the chairperson of the Presidential Review Committee, or the external consultant, shall prepare a written summary report of the on-campus interviews for the Chairman of the Board, identifying only the caucus from which the information is derived, and shall not individually identify any person or name associated with the information, and shall make a conclusion as to the performance of the President.
- 4.6.6 The written summary report shall be presented to the President and the Chairman of the Board and afford the President the opportunity to make any response, written or verbal, that the President deems appropriate.
- 4.6.7 The Chairman of the Board shall orally summarize the written summary report to the full Board during executive session to preserve the confidentiality of the

comments and information and in order to preserve the overall process as a personnel matter for the President.

- 4.6.8 The Chairman of the Board shall entertain a motion from the Board, outside of executive session, to accept the written summary report from the Presidential Review Committee, to place it in the personnel file of the President, and to report to the Higher Education Policy Commission that the comprehensive review of the President was conducted for purposes of the tri-annual review, or the end of contract cycle review, the dates it was conducted, the types of personnel involved in the review, and whether the conclusion of the review was favorable or unfavorable. To the extent that the conclusion of the review was unfavorable, the Chairman of the Board, in conjunction with the President, shall agree upon such terms, actions or other procedures to address any deficiency or concerns identified; and those deficiencies or concerns shall be specifically addressed in the next annual review.
- 4.6.9 The comprehensive review of the President shall be concluded sufficiently in advance of the last calendar year Board of Governors meeting such that the Board may receive the information prior to the end of the calendar year and make any appropriate recommendations or take any appropriate actions. It is presumed that the annual review shall be completed prior to the December Board of Governors meeting such that the Board may receive the information and act at the December meeting.

Section 5. Professional Leave

- 5.1 University Presidents deserve and need an opportunity to engage in professional renewal activities from time to time in order to focus on the implementation of new concepts, forward thinking, creative implementation of policies, renewed enthusiasm and rejuvenation as the Chief Executive Officer of the University. To the extent not explicitly addressed by the President's written contract, the President may seek approval of the Board of Governors for a leave of absence at full pay for up to two months, following five consecutive years of service as President for the purpose of professional renewal.
- 5.2 The dates of the leave, the professional renewal activities to be pursued during the leave and the appointment of an acting President shall be approved in advance by the Executive Committee of the Board of Governors, with the approval of the full Board by majority vote.
- 5.3 The professional renewal activities shall be directly related to the President's academic discipline or to the administration of higher education and in furtherance of the University's Mission. A written report of the experience shall be provided by the President to the Chairman of the Board at the conclusion of the leave, and copies shall be provided to the full Board.

Section 6. Resignation and Termination

- 6.1 A President may resign his or her appointment at any time upon written notification to the Board of Governors, addressed to the Chairman. The Board expects at least 60 days notice prior to the effective date of the resignation.
- 6.2 The Board of Governors may terminate the appointment of a President at any time, when in the Board's judgment, such action would be in the best interests of the University.
- 6.3 If the Board of Governors terminates the appointment of a President for any reason other than for "cause" the Board may offer the President a non-tenured, adjunct faculty position with the University, at a salary commensurate with that particular faculty position, not to extend beyond the remaining academic year; or if the President was conferred tenured status upon initial appointment, a tenured position not to extend beyond the remaining academic year, at a salary commensurate with tenured faculty, for that pro-rated period.
- 6.4 If the Board of Governors terminates the appointment of a President for "cause" that term is defined to include acts or inactions of malfeasance or misfeasance, may include commission or omission of acts, or acts in contravention of the policies of the Board or the direction of the Board of Governors, crimes involving moral turpitude, actions or inactions which denigrate the character and reputation of the University, or other such actions in contravention to the best interests of the University or Board of Governors policies.

Section 7. Grievance Procedure

- 7.1 If the President perceives a problem with the members of the Board of Governors, the President should first seek to resolve the problem with the Chairman of the Board. If the problem persists, the President may seek counsel of the Executive Committee of the Board of Governors. If the problem is not resolved through the Chairman of the Board or the Executive Committee, the President may seek advice of the Chancellor of the Higher Education Policy Commission. If the problem involves the Chairman of the Board, the President may immediately seek counsel of the Chancellor of the Higher Education Policy Commission. At all times, the advice of the Chancellor of the Higher Education Policy Commission shall resolve the dispute, or lead to voluntary resignation, or involuntary termination.